Both Sides of the Fence:
Disentangling Rhetoric Surrounding Undocumented Mexicans in the US

Denise Bowen MA, PA-C
Maureen Mickus PhD, MSG
Alma Rosales MS
The Making of a Border
1776 – The United States is Born
Treaty of Paris 1783 Establishes First US Border
Westward Expansion – 1783-1853
Adams-Onis Treaty 1819

[Map showing the boundaries of the Adams-Onis Treaty, 1819]
Mexico Wins Independence 1821
US Immigration to Mexico
US Mexican War 1846-1848
The Final Acquisition - 1853
History of Immigration
Mexico to US
Mexican Migrant Labor 1850-1880
The “Era of the Enganche” 1882-1920

- The “Hook”
- Active US recruitment of Mexican workers
¡Viva la revolución! 1910
Refugees from war 1910-1920
1917 – World War I

Labor shortages in US
The “Flood Tide” 1920’s
First Border Patrol - 1924

Role was to interrupt the flow of alcohol during prohibition
The Great Depression – 1929

The “Era of Deportations”

JOBLESS MEN
KEEP GOING
WE CAN’T TAKE CARE OF OUR OWN
CHAMBER OF COMMERCE
1942 - World War II
Labor Shortages – yet again
Bracero Accord - 1942

125,000 Braceros to Head for U.S.
MEXICO CITY, Aug. 8
More than 125,000 Mexican migrant workers will head for American farms this week, government officials estimated today.

This will be one of the largest movements of Mexican contract labor for harvesting crops in the United States. The unusually high number of applications for jobs was attributed to widespread crop failures in Mexico, causing small landowners and farm hands to abandon their fields.

Mexican Workers Wanted in October

Farmers and orchardists in Washington state have placed orders for approximately 6000 imported Mexican workers for the month of October, according to reports sent to...
Operation Wetback
1954

McALLEN, Tex., July 18 (UP) — The Border Patrol confirmed today that Mexican aliens arrested in the “wetback” round-up in South Texas were forced to pay their fares to El Paso, Tex., 600 miles away.

Harlon Carter, ‘Border Patrol chief, said that the money had been deducted from pay the illegal entrants had received for working on United States farms. More than 11,000 have been rounded-up for deportation since the drive began in the lower Rio Grande Valley.

The Mexicans are being taken to El Paso, border twin of Juarez, Mex., despite the fact many live just across the Rio Grande from where they were arrested. They are called “wetbacks” because many swim the Rio Grande to enter this country.

Newspapers in the valley reported they had received “literally dozens” of telephone calls from farmers who said that they had seen the patrol taking money from wetbacks.

The New York Times
Published: July 19, 1954
Chart 2: The Bracero Program, 1942-1967

- bracero contracts signed with the US government
- Operation "Wetback"
- the mechanization of US agriculture

End of Bracero Program 1964

• 1964: First numerical limits on legal immigration from Mexico
  • Advent of the maquiladora (sweat shops) when numbers of workers decreased

• 1979: Only 1,725 work visas issued
  • Compared to 438,000 in 1959
“Era of Undocumented Workers” 1965-1986

• Demand for workers continued, but supply dried up
• Subsequent increase in undocumented workers
• Entries offset by departures
Immigration Reform & Control Act 1986
Start of the “Era of Repression”

- Rising border enforcement
- Harsher anti-immigrant policies
- Lower wages

Results of militarization of the border:
- Deterrence of undocumented migrants from heading north
- Paradoxical effect of reducing the rate of return of those already north of the border
Effects of NAFTA - 1994

- Increase in maquiladoras
- Increase in migration from rural Mexico
Effects of 9/11

• Further tightening of border to prevent entry of terrorists

• Reduced the “back and forth” of illegal immigration further, resulting in longer stays of migrants and “settling out”.
Recent Demographics
The changing face of America, 1965–2065

% of the total population

Note: Whites, blacks and Asians include only single-race non-Hispanics; Asians include Pacific Islanders. Hispanics can be of any race.


PEW RESEARCH CENTER
Foreign-Born Population and Percentage of Total Population, for the United States: 1850 to 2010

FIGURE 5.2

From Europe and Canada to Latin America and Asia: A Dramatic Shift in Immigrant Origins

% of U.S. immigrants born in...

1960
- Europe/Canada: 84%
- Other Latin America: 4%
- South/East Asia: 4%
- Other: 3%

2013
- Europe/Canada: 14%
- South/East Asia: 26%
- Other Latin America: 24%
- Mexico: 28%
- Other: 8%

Source: Pew Research Center tabulations of 1960 U.S. decennial census data and 2013 American Community Survey (IPUMS)

PEW RESEARCH CENTER
U.S. Hispanic population

57 million Latinos were living in the U.S. in 2015.


9.6 14.5 22.6 35.7 50.8 56.6
U.S. Hispanics

**U.S. born**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Foreign born**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Two-thirds of the U.S. Hispanic population is of Mexican origin.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hispanic Population</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mexican</td>
<td>33.5 million</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puerto Rican</td>
<td>4.9 million</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salvadoran</td>
<td>2.0 million</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuban</td>
<td>1.9 million</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominican</td>
<td>1.5 million</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All other Hispanics</td>
<td>8.1 million</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pew Research Hispanic Center tabulations of 2011 American Community Survey (1% IPUMS)

(63.4% in 2015)
About one-in-four U.S. immigrants are unauthorized

Foreign-born population estimates, 2014

Unauthorized immigrants 11.1 million (25.5%)

Lawful immigrants 32.5 million (74.5%)

Naturalized citizens 19.0 million (43.6%)

Lawful permanent residents 11.7 million (26.9%)

Temporary lawful residents 1.7 million (4.0%)

Total U.S. foreign-born population: 43.6 million

Note: All numbers are rounded independently and are not adjusted to sum to U.S. total or other totals.
Source: Pew Research Center estimates for 2014 based on augmented American Community Survey (IPUMS).
“Overall Number of U.S. Unauthorized Immigrants Holds Steady Since 2009”

PEW RESEARCH CENTER
Figure 2
Estimates of the U.S. Unauthorized Immigrant Population from Mexico, 2000-2010 (millions)

2000 2001 2002 2003 2004 2005 2006 2007 2008 2009 2010
3 4.6 4.8 5.2* 5.5
4 6
5 6.0* 6.3
6 6.5
7 6.8
8 7.0*

Notes: Bars indicate low and high points of the approximate 90% confidence interval. The symbol * indicates the change from the previous year is statistically significant.

Source: Pew Hispanic Center estimates based on residual methodology applied to March Supplements to the Current Population Survey. See Methodology.

PEW RESEARCH CENTER

---

Figure 2
Nativity and Legal Status of Mexican-Origin Population in the U.S., 2011 (%)

Native born: 65%
Foreign born: 35%
Naturalized citizens: 6%
Legal permanent residents: 11%
Unauthorized migrants: 18%

Among unauthorized immigrants, a decline from Mexico but rise from elsewhere since 2009

In millions

Note: Shading surrounding lines indicates low and high points of the estimated 90% confidence interval. The differences in 1995 and 2000 between Mexican and Other are not statistically significant at 90% confidence interval.


PEW RESEARCH CENTER
I LOVE THIS COUNTRY
I JUST WANT TO STAY
The Myth of the Mexican Immigrant #1

Mexicans are surging across the US Border.
Between 2009 and 2014, 1 million Mexicans and their families left the US for Mexico.

During this same time, an estimated 860,000 Mexican nationals left Mexico to come to the U.S.

Thus, a smaller number of Mexican entered the US than the flow of families from the U.S. to Mexico.
The Myth of the Mexican Immigrant #2

Mexican immigrants are violent criminals.
Foreign-born individuals exhibit remarkably low levels of involvement in crime across their life course. (Bersani, 2014)
There is essentially no correlation between immigrants and violent crime. (Spenkuch, 2014)
“Keeping One’s Nose Down”

Immigrants generally have a greater incentive than native-born Americans to stay out of legal trouble, particularly those who are undocumented as they would risk deportation.

Immigrants who are in the US legally are required to pass a strict criminal background check.
“Immigrants in general — unauthorized immigrants in particular — are a self-selected group who generally come to the U.S. to work. And once they’re here, most of them want to keep their nose down and do their business, and they’re sensitive to the fact that they’re vulnerable.”

Marc Rosenblum, Deputy Director
U.S. Immigration Policy Program at the Migration Policy Institute
The Myth of the Mexican Immigrant #3

Mexican immigrants are stealing jobs.
Different Types of Jobs

Top 10 occupations for immigrant workers without high school diplomas

1. Maids and housekeepers
2. Cooks
3. Miscellaneous agricultural workers
4. Construction laborers
5. Janitors and building cleaners
6. Grounds maintenance workers
7. Driver/sales workers and truck drivers
8. Laborers and freight, stock, and material movers
9. Carpenters
10. Cashiers

Source: Tabulations by the author based on the 2013 American Community Survey

Top 10 occupations for native workers without high school diplomas

1. Cashiers
2. Drivers/sales workers and truck drivers
3. Janitors and building cleaners
4. Cooks
5. Laborers and freight, stock, and material movers
6. Construction laborers
7. Maids and housekeepers
8. Grounds maintenance workers
9. Waiters and waitresses
10. Nursing, psychiatric, and home-health workers

Source: Tabulations by the author based on the 2013 American Community Survey
Do native-born Americans want those jobs?
“I’m here to tell you right now, the jobs my guys do, they’re not taking them from anybody because there’s nobody that would do the jobs my guys do. I don’t care if you’re growing pickles or whatever; nobody here is going to pick pickles ... you just cannot find anybody local that can do that. And these people have such a desire, because this is the land of opportunity.”

~Michigan Farmer
Looking Toward the Future

• The number of U.S. natives without a high school education is *declining*. The share of immigrants with < high school education is *increasing*.

• By 2022, 4 million additional low-skilled jobs will be needed for the US job market. Native-born workers are increasingly expected to fill higher-skill jobs.

• Economic research indicates that 1,000 new immigrants to a US Metropolitan Area generate approximately 1,200 new local jobs—a 1.2 increase.
The Myth of the Mexican Immigrant #4

Mexican immigrants are draining public resources.
Immigrants Don't Drain Welfare. They Fund It.

BY LAURA RESTON | September 3, 2015
Native-born Americans aren’t paying for public resources for immigrants as much as immigrants are contributing to a welfare system that many of them are unable to take advantage of.


- Green card holders and refugees granted asylum as “qualified”
- All other immigrants—including undocumented workers are deemed as “not qualified” and therefore ineligible for welfare.
- The law requires even qualified immigrants had to spend five years in the US before they could apply for benefits like Medicaid, food stamps, or cash assistance for families with children.
According to the Social Security Administration, undocumented immigrants paid $13 billion in payroll taxes into the Social Security Trust Fund.
Undocumented immigrants pay billions of dollars in taxes each year.

• Undocumented immigrants pay sales taxes, just like every other consumer in the United States.

**More than half of undocumented immigrants have federal and state income, Social Security and Medicare taxes automatically deducted from their paychecks

*However, they are NOT eligible for any of the federal or state benefits that their tax dollars help to fund.
The Institute for Taxation and Economic Policy (ITEP) estimates that in 2010 households headed by undocumented immigrants paid 10.6 billion in state and local taxes in 2010.

-- $1.2 billion in personal income taxes
-- $1.2 billion in property taxes
-- $8.1 billion in sales taxes
## Vulnerable Populations

### General Hispanic in US
- 23.5% of Hispanic households are below the poverty level
- Least likely group within the US to be uninsured
- Only 2 in 3 Hispanics complete high school
- Almost 1 in 3 speak English “less than very well”

### Undocumented Mexicans
- Majority are confined to low-wage jobs
- No access to education
- No access to health insurance
- Subject to unscrupulous employers
- Subject to open hostility
- Live in isolation (fear)
Don’t deport my parents

• https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2jjjX-dOBAc&t=7s
Muchas Gracias
WARNING: DO NOT TRAVEL OUTSIDE THE UNITED STATES IF YOU ARE FROM AN AFFECTED COUNTRY

President Trump issued an Executive Order on Friday, January 27, 2017, that says that people who are citizens of Iran, Iraq, Libya, Somalia, Sudan, Syria and Yemen may not enter the U.S. for at least 90 days. At first, the government said that the ban fully included people with Lawful Permanent Resident or “Green Card” status as well as any other visas. On Sunday, January 29, 2017, the government said that Lawful Permanent Residents would be allowed to return to the United States unless there is “significant derogatory information” about them. Immigration lawyers do not know what will be considered “significant derogatory information.” So, we are discouraging all citizens of those countries from traveling outside of the United States for any reason. This includes travel to Canada.

تحذر: لا يرجى عدم السفر إلى خارج الولايات المتحدة الأمريكية، إذا كنت من رعايا أحد الدول المذكورة.

صدر الرئيس ترامب أمرًا فيما يخص حجب دخول 27 نسمة. في 27 كانون الثاني، 2017، يقول أن الممتنعين الذين يحملون الجنسية الإيرانية، العراقانية، الليبية، السودانية، السورية، الموتى، أو الذين لا يحملون التأشيرات أو-visas - في الولايات المتحدة الأمريكية لمدة 90 يومًا على الأقل. وهاي بتأشيرة الأشخاص الذين يحملون بطاقة الإقامة الدائمة (الكابس، الكرد) أو الذين يحملون تأشيرة الدخول (غيرها). صدرت الحكومة يوم الأحد 29 كانون الثاني 2017 لتوقفها الاجراءي الذي يحدد حظر دخولهم إلى الولايات المتحدة العربية، лиبية، السودانية، السورية، الموتى، أو الذين لا يحملون التأشيرات أو-visas - في الولايات المتحدة الأمريكية لمدة 90 يومًا على الأقل. وهاي بتأشيرة الأشخاص الذين يحملون بطاقة الإقامة الدائمة (الكابس، الكرد) أو الذين يحملون تأشيرة الدخول (غيرها). صدرت الحكومة يوم الأحد 29 كانون الثاني 2017 لتوقفها الاجراءي الذي يحدد حظر دخولهم إلى الولايات المتحدة العربية، лиبية، السودانية، السورية، الموتى، أو الذين لا يحملون التأشيرات أو-visas - في الولايات المتحدة العربية، лиبية، السودانية، سوريا، الموتى، أو الذين يحملون بطاقة الإقامة الدائمة (الكابس، الكرد) أو الذين يحملون تأشيرة الدخول (غيرها).